



Facilitator Guide for *Deliberative Scenario: MMR Vaccination in a Local Immigrant Community*

This guide provides facilitators with step-by-step instructions for facilitating deliberation. The deliberative scenario, “Deliberative Scenario: MMR Vaccination in a Local Immigrant Community” is particularly well-suited for public health ethics professionals, and can be used in a variety of other settings.

Phase 1: Before the Deliberation

Provide Background and Context

Provide participants with “[Deliberative Scenario: MMR Vaccination in a Local Immigrant Community](#)” and with “[Guide to Democratic Deliberation for Public Health Ethics Professionals](#).” If desired, see additional readings on deliberation from the *Additional Resources* section in “Guide to Democratic Deliberation for Public Health Ethics Professionals.” Ask participants to consider the differences between deliberation and debate or discussion, and the goals and method of deliberation.

Clearly state the goals of the deliberation: To provide a recommendation on whether the “no shots, no school” law should now be enforced, following the diagnosis of a Somali child with measles.

Provide all participants with the following reading (available online) to learn about various perspectives regarding the seasonal influenza vaccine for public health employees.

- Bahta, L. and A. Ashkir. (2015). Addressing MMR vaccine resistance in Minnesota’s Somali community. *Minnesota Medicine*, 98(10), 33-36.

Assign Roles

Option 1: Assign each participant a role from among the following stakeholders: a teacher or school administrator, leaders from the local Somali community and mosque, the school nurse, a local pediatrician, health department disease control and prevention staff, the county attorney’s office, parents of students at the elementary school, refugee services worker.

Option 2: Ask participants to generate a list of stakeholders and assign roles from that list. This list should include participants with a wide variety of perspectives on the matter.



Note: You can also assign multiple participants to the same role, as people in the same role can still have different perspectives.

Role-based Resources

Based on a participant's specified role, refer to role-specific readings and resources from the additional readings/resources section at the end of this document. These resources provide additional perspectives for each role.

Phase 2: During the Deliberation

Questions to Guide and Focus Deliberation

Remind participants of the goal of this exercise: To practice democratic deliberation by considering many different perspectives, providing reasons for their arguments, listening respectfully to opposing viewpoints, and finding a way forward.

Instruct participants to begin the deliberation by introducing themselves and stating which role they will play.

During the deliberation, ensure that the following questions have received sufficient attention. If a question has not been answered, pose the question to the group.

- What is the purpose of the MMR vaccine? Who could benefit and who could be harmed?
- How is measles transmitted? Is one case of measles cause for concern? If not, how many cases of measles would need to be diagnosed before there is a significant public health threat?
- Are there any socioeconomic, cultural, or other differences between those in the Somali community who do get the MMR vaccine and those who do not?
- How has the information about the MMR vaccine been presented to members of the Somali community? Has the information been presented in a clear format, taking into account potential language barriers?
- What options do members of the Somali community have to receive the MMR vaccine? Is it convenient and affordable?
 - What barriers to members of the Somali community face when trying to receive vaccines? How can these barriers be addressed?
- What concerns do members of the Somali community have about the MMR vaccine?
 - How prevalent is the fear of autism resulting from the MMR vaccine? How has this fear been addressed? How can this fear be more adequately addressed in the future?



- How prevalent are concerns about the MMR vaccine adhering to Halal dietary restrictions? How has this concern been addressed? How can this concern be more adequately addressed in the future?
- Do members of the Somali community have a lower rate of any other types of vaccinations?
- Given the rate of vaccination for children in the Somali community, do the children who are not vaccinated pose a serious threat to the health of other children?
- How do members of the school community (teachers, nurses, administrators, parents) feel about the rate of vaccination?
 - Has there been any indication that children from the Somali community are being stigmatized or discriminated against?

Strategies to Improve the Deliberative Process

If some participants are quiet or refrain from contributing, ask the group: Are there any views that have been left out? Whose views might those be?

If there is a swift and seemingly straightforward answer or a premature dominant view developing that could crowd out other views, ask the group: What are some other perspectives that we have not heard or considered yet?

Strategies to Improve Content

If participants come up with recommendations without justification, ask: What evidence supports the suggested course of action? What are the ethical bases for this recommendation? Is there a justified reason for this recommendation? Is there evidence that could support an alternative course of action?

Scenario Shift

If participants reach consensus on recommendations with time left over, you might introduce a shift in the scenario. Pick one of more of the following scenario shifts and ask participants to discuss how this new information changes their recommendations.

- Another case of the measles is diagnosed in another child from the Somali community.
- Somali families begin to petition for an exemption from the MMR vaccine in response to the news that the “no shots, no school” law could soon be enforced.
- Another case of the measles is diagnosed, this time in a Caucasian child.



- A group of parents petitions the school board demanding that all children from the Somali community receive the MMR vaccine immediately, and threaten to remove their children from school if this does not occur.

Developing a Policy Recommendation

Ask participants to develop recommendations that reflect the consensus-driven process of deliberation. The recommendations should include mutually acceptable reasons for a policy choice.

Phase 3: After the Deliberation

Presenting the Policy Recommendation

Instruct participants to draft a memorandum to the school superintendent describing their recommendations and the justifications for them. Alternatively, ask participants to present this information orally.

Assessment and Reflection

Ask participants to reflect on the process and outcome of the deliberation using the following questions.

- Do the recommendations provide both scientific and ethical reasons for the stated course of action?
- Are all of the deliberators satisfied with the outcome? If not, was a dissenting statement included?
- Does this policy recommendation seem more legitimate than one decided made by majority vote? Why or why not?
- What are the strengths of deliberative decision making? What are the weaknesses?
- Is the set of recommendations contingent upon new facts or values coming to light? When would a new deliberation be needed?

Additional Readings/Resources

If the role assigned is *ethics committee member* or *health department disease control staff*, refer to the following resources:

- Gahr, P., DeVries, A.S., Wallace, G., *et al.* (2014). An outbreak of measles in an undervaccinated community. *Pediatrics*, 134(1), e220-e228.
- “Measles (Rubeola).” (2016, April). Minnesota Department of Health, Vaccine-Preventable Disease Section. [Webpage].



<http://www.health.state.mn.us/divs/idepc/diseases/measles/measlesfacts.pdf>.

Accessed September 15, 2016.

- “There are many Somali and non-Somali children with autism spectrum disorder.” [n.d.]. University of Minnesota Institute on Community Integration. [Webpage]. http://rtc.umn.edu/autism/doc/Somali_parent_handout.pdf. Accessed September 15, 2016.
- “Autism Spectrum Disorders and the Somali Community.” [n.d.]. Minnesota Department of Health. [Webpage]. <http://www.health.state.mn.us/divs/cfh/topic/autism/somali.cfm>. Accessed September 15, 2016.

If the role assigned is *teacher* or *school administrator*, refer to the following resources:

- Urist, J. (2015, April). “How schools are dealing with anti-vaccine parents.” *The Atlantic*. [Webpage]. <http://www.theatlantic.com/education/archive/2015/02/schools-may-solve-the-anti-vaccine-parenting-deadlock/385208/>. Accessed August 26, 2016.
- Silverman, R.D., and K.S. Hendrix. (2015). Point: should childhood vaccination against measles be a mandatory requirement for attending school? Yes. *Chest*, 148(4), 852-854.
- Ali, M. [n.d.] Understanding immunization in Somali Communities in Washington. Presentation at Within Reach conference. [Webpage]. http://www.withinreachwa.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/Ali_Somali_Oct12.pdf. Accessed August 26, 2016.

If the role assigned is *representative of the Somali community* or *mosque leader*, refer to the following resources:

- Schröder-Bäck, P. and K. Martakis. (2015). Counterpoint: should childhood vaccination against measles be a mandatory requirement for attending school? No. *Chest*, 148(4), 854-856.
- Grabenstein, J.D. (2012). What the world’s religions teach, applied to vaccines and immune globulins.” *Vaccine*, 31(2013), 2011-2023.
- “State vaccination exemptions for children entering public schools.” (2016). ProCon.org. [Webpage]. <http://vaccines.procon.org/view.resource.php?resourceID=003597>. Accessed August 26, 2016.



If the role assigned is *pediatrician* or *school nurse*, refer to the following resources:

- Hendrix, K.S., et al. (2014). Vaccine message framing and parents' intent to immunize their infants for MMR. *Pediatrics*, 134(3), e675-e683.
- Silverman, R.D., and K.S. Hendrix. (2015). Point: should childhood vaccination against measles be a mandatory requirement for attending school? Yes. *Chest*, 148(4), 852-854.
- "Why a few unvaccinated children are an even bigger threat than you think." (2015, February). *The Washington Post*. [Webpage]. https://www.washingtonpost.com/posteverything/wp/2015/02/03/why-a-few-unvaccinated-children-are-an-even-bigger-threat-than-you-think/?utm_term=.b0eab4ed28d9. Accessed August 30, 2016.

If the role assigned is *a representative from the county attorney's office*, refer to the following resources:

- Ciolli, A. (2008). Mandatory school vaccinations: the role of tort law. *Yale Journal of Biology and Medicine*, 81, 129-137.
- "Minnesota's Immunization Law Exemption Provision." [n.d.]. Minnesota Department of Health. [Webpage]. <http://www.health.state.mn.us/divs/idepc/immunize/laws/exemption.html>. Accessed September 15, 2016.
- "U.S. Judge will not block California school vaccination law." (2016, August). *Reuters*. [Webpage]. <http://www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-vaccine-california-idUSKCN1112I6>. Accessed September 15, 2016.
- "Measles (Rubeola)—For Healthcare Professionals." [n.d.]. *Centers for Disease Control and Prevention*. [Webpage]. <http://www.cdc.gov/measles/hcp/index.html>. Accessed September 15, 2016.

If the role assigned is *parent*, refer to the following resources:

- "Five important reasons to vaccinate your children." [n.d.] *Vaccines.gov*. [Webpage]. https://www.vaccines.gov/more_info/features/five-important-reasons-to-vaccinate-your-child.html. Accessed August 26, 2016.
- Wallace, K. "Open letter to parents: why you should vaccinate your children." (2015, February). *CNN*. [Webpage]. <http://www.cnn.com/2015/02/04/living/feat-measles-parents-vaccinate-children/>. Accessed August 26, 2016.
- "How one unvaccinated child sparked Minnesota measles outbreak." (2014, June). *CBS News*. [Webpage]. <http://www.cbsnews.com/news/how-one->



[unvaccinated-child-sparked-minnesota-measles-outbreak/](#). Accessed September 15, 2016.

If the role assigned is *refugee services worker*, refer to the following resources:

- “Somalis in Minnesota: common medical issues and cultural concerns of Somali patients.” (n.d.). *Culture Care Connection*. [Webpage]. <http://www.culturecareconnection.org/matters/diversity/somali.html>. Accessed August 26, 2016.
- Information for King County Healthcare Providers Regarding Vaccine Hesitancy in the Somali Community.” Public Health Department, Seattle & King County. [Webpage]. https://ethnomed.org/clinical/communicable-diseases/vaccine-hesitancy/Somali_Vaccine_Hesitancy_Sept_2011.pdf. Accessed August 26, 2016.